Sustainable Development Goals and Digital Economy in EAEU countries

November 22, 2019
Christopher Miller
The World Bank’s tools for SDGs’ monitoring
How are the SDGs Monitored?

- Inter-agency and Expert Group on SDG Indicators (IEAG-SDGs)
- Develops global indicator framework
- Includes member states; regional and international agencies are observers
The Bank’s SDG Indicators Group

• Members from across the Bank’s thematic global practices providing technical input to all 17 goals
• Bank responsible for reporting on 21 indicators covering 9 goals and involved in another 20+.
• All work closely aligned with the Bank’s own Twin Goals
The World Bank is the “custodian” of SDGs targets

- The WB participates in IAEG-SDGs as an observer and is a custodian for 21 indicators and is involved in the development and monitoring of an additional 20 indicators. The indicators cover a wider range of topics in which the World Bank has expertise, including poverty and inequality, social protection, gender equality, financial access, remittances, health, energy, infrastructure etc.

- A major goal of the WB SDG Indicators Group is to improve the data quality of these indicators. SDG indicators are classified into 3 tiers:
  - **Tier 1** – indicators with an established methodology and good data coverage;
  - **Tier 2** – have an established methodology but lack good data coverage;
  - **Tier 3** – indicators currently lack both sound method and adequate data.

As of December 31, 2018, of the 21 indicators the Bank is responsible for 7 are Tier 1, 10 are Tier 2 and 4 are Tier 3 indicator.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Bank Unit</th>
<th>Tier</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.1.1</td>
<td>$1.90 poverty</td>
<td>Poverty GP, DECPI, DECDG</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.2.1</td>
<td>Monetary poverty, national</td>
<td>Poverty GP</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.2.2</td>
<td>Multidimensional poverty, national</td>
<td>Poverty GP, DECPI</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.3.1</td>
<td>Social Protection Coverage</td>
<td>SPL GP</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.4.2</td>
<td>Land tenure security</td>
<td>DECAR</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>3.8.2</td>
<td>Universal Health Care</td>
<td>HNP &amp; DECHD</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>5.1.1</td>
<td>Legal framework for Gender equality</td>
<td>DECIG</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>7.1.1</td>
<td>Electricity access</td>
<td>Energy GP</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>8.10.2</td>
<td>Access to Finance</td>
<td>DECFP</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>9.1.1</td>
<td>Rural road access</td>
<td>Transport &amp; ICT GP</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>9.3.2</td>
<td>Small-scale industries with loan / credit line</td>
<td>DECIG</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>10.1.1</td>
<td>Growth of B40 vs average</td>
<td>Poverty GP</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>10.2.1</td>
<td>People under 50% median income</td>
<td>Poverty GP, DECDG</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>10.7.1</td>
<td>Recruitment costs</td>
<td>SPL GP</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>10.c.1</td>
<td>Remittance costs</td>
<td>Finance and Markets GP</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>16.5.2</td>
<td>Bribery</td>
<td>DECIG</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>16.6.1</td>
<td>Actual versus approved budget</td>
<td>Governance GP</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>17.3.2</td>
<td>Remittance volume / total GDP</td>
<td>DECDG</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>17.4.1</td>
<td>Debt service / exports of goods and services</td>
<td>DECDG</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>17.13.1</td>
<td>Macroeconomic Dashboard</td>
<td>DECDG</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>17.17.1</td>
<td>Amount of Public Pvt Partnership</td>
<td>GTIAK</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
data.worldbank.org/sdgatlas
An all-new 2018 edition of the Atlas of Sustainable Development Goals, featuring over 180 annotated data visualizations on trends, data and measurement issues related to the 17 SDGs.
Open Data. Open Code. All data visualizations built with R and ggplot for a computationally reproducible publication.

Young children and infants are most vulnerable to the effects of malnutrition. Globally, over 95 million fewer children were stunted in 2016 than in 1990.

Number of children under age 5 that are stunted, height for age (millions)

- South Asia
- East Asia & Pacific
- Sub-Saharan Africa
- Latin America & Caribbean
- Middle East & North Africa
- North America

Note: Estimates not available for Europe & Central Asia due to poor data coverage.

Source: UNICEF, WHO and World Bank. WDI (SH.STA.STNT.ZS); Health Nutrition and Population Statistics (SP.POP.0004.FE; SP.POP.0004.MA).
## EAEU countries lag in similar areas

*The SDG Index score signifies a country's position between the worst (0) and the best or target (100) outcomes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>SDG1</th>
<th>SDG2</th>
<th>SDG3</th>
<th>SDG4</th>
<th>SDG5</th>
<th>SDG6</th>
<th>SDG7</th>
<th>SDG8</th>
<th>SDG9</th>
<th>SDG10</th>
<th>SDG11</th>
<th>SDG12</th>
<th>SDG13</th>
<th>SDG14</th>
<th>SDG15</th>
<th>SDG16</th>
<th>SDG17</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Armenia</td>
<td>98.9</td>
<td>54.1</td>
<td>76.9</td>
<td>88.2</td>
<td>69.9</td>
<td>73.4</td>
<td>93.6</td>
<td>55.5</td>
<td>29.2</td>
<td>50.2</td>
<td>75.7</td>
<td>80.9</td>
<td>92.2</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>59.9</td>
<td>71.1</td>
<td>59.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belarus</td>
<td>99.9</td>
<td>59.5</td>
<td>81.4</td>
<td>93.3</td>
<td>82.1</td>
<td>95.4</td>
<td>83.4</td>
<td>79.1</td>
<td>31.5</td>
<td>85.9</td>
<td>81.1</td>
<td>82.1</td>
<td>91.1</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>70.2</td>
<td>67.9</td>
<td>59.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kazakhstan</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>52.2</td>
<td>73.2</td>
<td>85.3</td>
<td>77.4</td>
<td>89.6</td>
<td>74.8</td>
<td>72.2</td>
<td>40.2</td>
<td>62.2</td>
<td>84.0</td>
<td>55.0</td>
<td>73.0</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>56.8</td>
<td>66.5</td>
<td>47.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kyrgyz Republic</td>
<td>98.6</td>
<td>61.7</td>
<td>71.5</td>
<td>84.7</td>
<td>64.6</td>
<td>85.5</td>
<td>84.2</td>
<td>61.6</td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>79.4</td>
<td>88.6</td>
<td>74.2</td>
<td>87.3</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>67.7</td>
<td>54.6</td>
<td>66.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russian Federation</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>48.8</td>
<td>77.2</td>
<td>93.8</td>
<td>71.6</td>
<td>92.8</td>
<td>85.4</td>
<td>65.4</td>
<td>45.9</td>
<td>54.1</td>
<td>83.8</td>
<td>70.5</td>
<td>80.1</td>
<td>51.8</td>
<td>59.5</td>
<td>38.4</td>
<td>54.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Role of digital transformation in implementation of SDGs
‘... We identify a series of systemic gaps in the overall response to the 2030 Agenda and call for specific actions to fill them. These include placing special focus on the most vulnerable to ensure that as countries progress, they leave no one behind; ensuring adequate and well-directed financing; strengthening institutions and making them more effective and inclusive; strengthening economies and building resilience; [...] harnessing science, technology and innovation with a greater focus on digital transformation for sustainable development.’

Special edition: progress towards the Sustainable Development Goals Report of the Secretary-General, May 2019
Digital technologies are powerful tools that can have a transformational effect on the SDGs through many channels

- **Direct role as a target:** related to infrastructure and partnerships (9.c.1, 17.6.2, 17.8.1, etc)

- **As a means of scale:** eg 75% of the more than 2 billion adults without a bank account have mobile internet; new service delivery models for education; poverty reduction through targeting of social assistance; role in hunger, gender equality, institutions, etc.

- **As a source of growth and innovation:** An increase of 10% in fixed broadband penetration yields 0.8% in GDP; an increase of 10% in mobile broadband yields an increase of 1.5%; Central to improving productivity and driving innovation in agriculture, health, and other sectors.

- **As an enabler of evidence based policy making, international cooperation, PPPs, and knowledge exchange**
The potential of digital technology to impact SDGs depends on maximizing digital dividends....

**Economy**
- Greater market concentration/ less competition
- Labor market disruption

**Society**
- Erosion of trust and confidence in government
- Regions/ communities left behind by digital transformation

**Environment**
- E-waste and emissions from the digital sector

And mitigating potential risks

- Investment is growing (USD 354b in 2016) but only 23.5b in low and middle-income economies
- Yet, global growth in the % of hh connected has slowed (54.8%)
- Digital divide remains persistent
- Less than 30% of the world’s population proficient in basic ICT skills
- Women are 23% less likely than men to use mobile internet (widest gap in SE Asia and Sub Saharan Africa)
- Share of women working in the digital sector continues to decline.

While improving access...
EAEU Digital Agenda – Challenges and Opportunities
The EAEU 2025 Digital Agenda: Prospects and Recommendations

• joint study conducted by EEC and WBG in 2017 to research the international experience and develop recommendations to maximize the economic impact of the development of the digital space and the implementation of the Digital Agenda of the EAEU.
Challenges: digital transformation in EAEU
To date, the level of ICT use in the countries of the Union is low and is lower than in ASEAN and the EU. There is a noticeable lag in the development of the EAEU infrastructure when compared to the EU and OECD countries. To address these gaps and ensure economic growth and competitiveness in the region, strategic objectives of the Digital Agenda should include reforms that foster innovation.

WEF Global Competitiveness Index

Business ICT usage score (1-7)

To date, the level of ICT use in the countries of the Union is low and is lower than in ASEAN and the EU.
Challenges: digital transformation in EAEU

Indicators of the EAEU countries in digital trade in comparison with other regions
Opportunities: digital transformation in EAEU

Digital dividends and fundamentals of the strategy for implementation of the Digital Agenda of the EAEU
Opportunities: digital transformation in EAEU

Digital Dividends
- Growth
- Jobs
- Services

Digital Leadership Vision & Strategy
- Digital Solutions for Businesses
- Digital Solutions for Citizens
- Digital Solutions for Government

Digital Foundations: Shared Digital Platforms and Infrastructure
- Analog Foundation/Enabling Environment: Regulations, Institutions, Skills

National Digital Economy Building Blocks

EAEU Integration Directions
- Digital Transformation of EAEU Integration Processes
- Digital Transformation of Key Markets in the EAEU
- Digital Transformation of Economic Sectors and Across Sectors in the EAEU
- Development of Digital Infrastructure of the EAEU

Additional Digital Dividends
- Improved Quality of Gov. & Inter-Gov. Services
- Innovative Jobs & Digital Assets
- Productivity & Growth
- Access to Global Markets & Competitiveness
- Increased Opportunities & Reduced Risks

Multiplier Effect
Opportunities: digital transformation in EAEU

EAEU Digital Space 2025: Key actions at Union level

A. Vision, strategy, policy
   - A1 Vision and strategy
   - A2 Legislation (telecommunications, data, e-commerce)
   - A3 New Business Models
   - A4 Digital Innovation Policy and the ICT Industry
   - A5 Communication policy

B. Enabling environment
   - B1 Management structure
   - B2 Investment Fund: Strengthening the Union
   - B3 Institutions (telecommunications, data protection, CERT-EU)
   - B4 PPP Guidelines
   - B5 Measuring the benefits and results of monitoring
   - B6 Applied research and development
   - B7 Skills development

C. Digital Infrastructure
   - C1 Telecommunications and Internet connection
   - C2 Services of electronic identification and electronic authentication
   - C3 Information Security
   - C4 Cloud infrastructure and initiatives

D. Digital solutions
   - D1 Electronic customs
   - D2 E-commerce
   - D3 Electronic logistics
   - D4 Digitalization of industries
   - D5 Data Economy
   - D6 Trading platform
   - D7 Digital Finances / Fintech
   - D8 The EAEU digital integration platform
   - D9 Interoperability, IT Standards
THANK YOU!